

**CITY OF MISHAWAKA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
November 1, 2016**

A regular meeting of the Mishawaka Historic Preservation Commission was held Tuesday November 1, 2016.

Meeting was called to order at City Hall at 4:00 pm.

Commission members in attendance: Mike Bultinck, Terry DeMaegd, Dave Eisen, Judy Gray, Jennifer Johns, Doug Merritt, Nancy Seidler, Faye Sullivan, and Kate Voelker. Advisory members present: Alan Grzeskowiak, Shirley McAlister, and Thomas Morris. Staff: Christa Hill and Ken Prince. Public: Ruth Pavich, Mary Beth Torma, Jerry Enders, Rachel Fredenburg, Will Smith, Billie Clemens, and David Guerin.

A motion by Kate Voelker, seconded by Nancy Siedler, approved the minutes of the October 4, 2016 meeting as presented.

PUBLIC HEARING

COA #16-03: Certificate of Appropriateness for Daniel Ward House, 1443 University Drive Court for the addition of a handicap ramp.

Andy Lace, with Andy Lace Construction, the contractor, spoke on behalf of the owners, Blackburn and Green. The owners plan to use the house as a conference center, and being personal injury attorneys, they have need for a handicap ramp. The front and side porches have been reconstructed after the house was moved. Mr. Lace's original plan was to have the handicap ramp come off the side porch, but after speaking with Staff, realized the back porch would be less visible from the street. Most of the ramp is hidden by the house, and partially by the side porch. The material is treated wood, and in the spring, the entire house will be painted.

Terry DeMaegd asked if this meets the Americans with Disabilities Accessibility Guidelines. Construction of a handicap ramp requires one inch of rise for one foot of run. The side porch would have required 36' or ramp, where the rear only requires 24' of ramp. Terry ask how it will connect to the new parking lot that was just poured. The parking lot will be connected to the ramp by brick pavers. Mike Bultinck confirmed brick pavers were an acceptable material. Nancy Siedler asked where the parking lot was in relation to the ramp. Mr. Lace explained it was to the front of the lot and south of the house.

Terry DeMaegd made the Finding of Facts motion, seconded by Dave Eisen.

I move that the Mishawaka Historic Preservation Commission find as a fact that the proposed project at 1443 University Drive Court, known as Certificate of Appropriateness #16-03 if constructed according to the plans submitted on October 17, 2016, is compatible with the character of the Daniel Ward House, for the reasons that it will provide access and utilizing materials that compliment, and are in harmony with character of the original house.

Terry DeMaegd made the Approval motion, seconded by Dave Eisen.

Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Historic Preservation Commission grant a certificate of appropriateness to Blackburn and Green for Certificate of Appropriateness #16-03.

CITY OF MISHAWAKA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
November 1, 2016

COA #16-04: Certificate of Appropriateness for Carnegie Library, 122 N Hill Street for various items related to converting the building to a restaurant and banquet hall.

George and Tammy Pesak, owners, appeared to present the changes. First they addressed Staff's comment of the Corten steel screen. The function of the screen is to hide mechanical equipment. All the alternative materials look plastic, which isn't what they want. Corten steel will be used in other areas and they wanted consistency. This material was used in the 1920's.

Starting on the west elevation, facing Hill Street, has the least changes. The tuck-pointing is complete. Planning on pulling out overgrown landscaping from window wells. Originally, it was a scripture above the door, when the library moved, it was removed, but still exists in the library. Other Carnegie Libraries, like the one in Michigan City, have stained glass, so replacing with stained glass would not be out of character. A new monument sign is proposed. It will be oriented to be seen from driving either way. All the upstairs windows are preservable, but the downstairs ones are rotted and need to be replaced. Kate Voelker confirmed the windows were wood.

On the north elevation, facing First Street, the iron grate will still provide ventilation to attic. All the extra bricks were used up to repair around the top of the window on the north. Dave Eisen asked if the elevation showed the hill being cut back like was mentioned during the tour last month. The elevation does not show that, but it will only be 12"-18", just enough to grade away from the window wells. The ground will be graded around the window wells on the west too.

The most changes will be to the east. The petitioner passed around picture of the stone wall. Kate asked for the dimensions of the wall. The wall will be 4' high and 24' long. Mike Bultinck asked if the wall would be a masonry wall or a Gabian design. Mr. Pesak answered it was Gabian design, because it looks more modern. Mike followed up by asking what material it be filled with? Mr. Pesak answered limestone, because it is a typical product of Indiana. For clarification, Gabian is a cage that is filled with rock. Terry DeMaegd asked if the wall was connected to the building. Mr. Pesak said neither the wall or canopy will be connected in a way that requires the wall to be load bearing. The canopy is freestanding with a cantilevered foundation. Doug Merritt asked if the bolt was decorative or what type of material will be used. Mr. Pesak said it will not be seen at all. There is metal return back to the wall, that is not shown on either the cutaway drawing or the elevation. On the cutaway drawing, the support beam to the stone wall is an option if the foundation cannot hold the weight of the canopy. Doug also suggested banker wire as an alternative to Corten steel for the screen. It is a versatile material when it comes to color and gauge. The architect say the Corten steel is pre oxidized with an acid finish so there is no bleeding. Mike has used Corten steel in other places and it still bleeds. What you can't see on the elevation is the screen is recessed and a new rubber roof will be put down, so any bleed will be on the roof, which will be drained. Barn door will be attached to the existing raceway with a glass garage door behind it. The EFIS will be used to block air conditioning units on the roof. Doug asked what color the EFIS would be? It would match the limestone. Again, for clarification, EFIS is a framed wall with stucco.

CITY OF MISHAWAKA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
November 1, 2016

The handicap ramp will be steel. The walk in cooler will match the “new” brick. Kate asked which door would be the handicap ramp would access. The door that used to have the deck. It enters the kitchen.

In order to get more bricks, they have to lower the chimney. The building/fire code requires three feet above the roofline, and the existing chimney is eight feet above the roofline. Ken Prince asked what the alternative was to lowering the chimney. There would be a visible change in the bricks. The closest still won’t match. You just can’t make bricks that look like the original. Mike asked how much brick is needed. Their mason is going to have to look close up at each area to determine what needs to be replaced. Kate asked if they could use the inner brick. Mike agreed that would compromise the integrity of the wall. Doug asked if the details would be maintained. Faye Sullivan asked if the chimney was aesthetic or functional? There is a fireplace on the first level that will use the chimney.

Mr. Pesak asked what material for gutters, copper? Several Commissioners remember other copper gutters have been stolen and required COAs to replace with other materials. A black or brown painted had been approved on previous houses to give the same look without the temptation of stealing.

Ken asked how tall Corten steel screen would be. The concern is that it does not block the window. The height of the screen would only need to be 28” and that leaves 11” below the windows. The stipulations were discussed before the motion was made. Doug asked Staff if there were other steps or if this was our only review. Ken answered this is the only step for the HPC, but there will be an agreement between Redevelopment about the parking lot to require revised drawings before issuing permits. When a revised plan is submitted, it will be circulated to all Commissioners, but no additional action is needed.

Doug Merritt made the Finding of Facts motion, seconded by Mike Bultinck.

I move that the Mishawaka Historic Preservation Commission find as a fact that the proposed project at 122 N. Hill Street, known as Certificate of Appropriateness #16-04 if constructed according to the plans submitted on October 17, 2016, and the following four stipulations is compatible with the character of the Carnegie Library single site:

1. The chimney height will not see a reduction greater than 4’;
2. The supplemental detail of the cantilever awning shall be revised to reflect a return design on the north elevation;
3. The Corten steel screen on the south elevation shall be revised in drawing form to reflect exact height necessary to obscure/hide mechanicals but not the window details; and
4. The revised elevation shall also reflect recessed dimensions of the Corten steel screen so that any bleeding, if applicable, will be retained to the flat roof deck.

Kate Voelker made the Approval motion, seconded by Mike Bultinck.

Based on the preceding findings of fact, I move that the Historic Preservation Commission grant a certificate of appropriateness to George and Tammy Pesak for Certificate of Appropriateness #16-04.

CITY OF MISHAWAKA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
November 1, 2016

COMMITTEE REPORTS

A. Historic Districts/Plaques

Cliff Zenor was not able to make the meeting, but sent an email that he heard our mason for the Eberhart Major house plaque was not taking any new work due to an illness. He will follow up to see if we are still on his list or should we start looking for a new contractor. He has not been paid yet, in fact, he won't be paid until after the work is done and an invoice is submitted.

B. Public Relations & Community Education

We will discuss the Fred Fitzsimmons outreach under old business.

C. Staff Notes

Ken Prince invited the Commission to meet at Castle Manor for the December meeting. The City is proposing some work to the building and although not designated, would like to run it by the HPC. Nancy Siedler asked what the work entailed. Ken said it was a storage room for tables and chairs. Mike Bultnick asked if there were any electrical, mechanical issues. Ken answered the roof is in bad shape. Faye Sullivan asked if any inside update would be done. Any other work, like making the bathrooms accessible or updating kitchen cabinets will be based on the project budget. A motion made to move the meeting. Christa Hill will notify the media of the location change.

OLD BUSINESS

Marker for the Fred Fitzsimmons house (524 W Grove)

At our last meeting local Pete DeKeever, author of the Walking Tour and Freddie Fitzsimmons books, spoke about the importance of Fred Fitzsimmons and the significance of the house at 524 W Grove. Previous discussions decided not a plaque, like the designated houses, but some sort of marker. Christa Hill offered an example of signs the City has made in the past. Ken Prince suggested the design of the sign be decided on before sending out for bids. If we use City money, the sign must be placed in the right-of-way. Kate Voelker asked what the guidelines were for a marker. Her house had a famous person who lived there and a book was written about. Mike Bultinck asked if we foresaw doing more of these in the future. Ken suggested a maximum of half a dozen in the next ten years. The rarity should make it special.

Doug Merritt made the motion approve a marker for the Fred Fitzsimmons house (524 W Grove), but that the design would be determined at the next meeting, seconded by Dave Eisen.

Normain Heights Subcommittee Update

A neighborhood meeting was held on October 24 at Liberty School. Approximately 30 Normain Heights residents attended, along with 3 Council members. Todd Zeiger from Indiana Landmarks explained what a Conservation District was and also what it wasn't. There was reference to a "charter" which was later found in paperwork to be restrictive covenants. Staff explained that the City doesn't enforce restrictive covenants.

**CITY OF MISHAWAKA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
November 1, 2016**

Ruth Pavich said the reason for the meeting was to get out the info and ask for approval. Each of the task force members have been collecting signatures. They have 60 so far. Alan Grzeskowiak asked the neighbors if they got any feedback as they were collecting the signatures. Terry DeMaegd asked what the magic number was. Ken Prince explained it wasn't a specific number, but more of a consensus. If everyone you talk to is in favor, we don't need all 300. Will Smith, Liberty Mutual, pointed out the restrictive covenants also refer to commercial and an acre to God. While there previously was a church on the west side of Main Street, we can't make someone put in a church. Doug Merritt can recognize those in the guidelines/history. Other things that need to be added are the floor plans. Kate Voelker said we kept the guidelines broad because that's what the neighborhood wanted. Christa reminded the Commission that in three years they have to vote again to keep it a Conservation District or it becomes a full district.

There was no NEW BUSINESS.

Adjournment

A motion to adjourn was made by Mike Bultinck, seconded by Doug Merritt. The meeting was adjourned at 5:55 pm.

Terry DeMaegd, Chairman

Christa Hill, Secretary