

CITY OF MISHAWAKA

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION December 1, 2015

A regular meeting of the Mishawaka Historic Preservation Commission was held Tuesday, December 1, 2015 in Room 205, City Hall, 600 E. Third, Mishawaka , IN.

Meeting was called to order at 4:03 pm.

Commission members in attendance: Terry DeMaegd, Dave Eisen, Judy Gray, Jennifer Johns, Doug Merritt, and Faye Sullivan. Advisory members present: Shirley McAlister, Bryan Tanner, Cliff Zenor and Alan Grzeskowiak. Staff: Christa Hill and Ken Prince. Presenter: Tom Morris.

Minutes:

A motion by Dave Eisen and seconded by Doug Merritt approved the minutes of the November 4, 2015 meeting minutes as presented.

PUBLIC HEARING

HPC #15-04: Certificate of Appropriateness for Thomas Morris to replace steep and fiberglass garage door to carriage style door with 3-pane arched windows and cherry woodgrain finish.

Tom Morris recently became the owner of 128 N Brook Avenue, part of the Riviera Place Historic District. He passed around color photos of what was existing and the type of door he hoped to install. Terry DeMaegd asked if the garage was original to the house. Mr. Morris stated it was not, the original garage was below the house. The garage was built in the late 1940's, but the garage door is probably no older than 15 years. Dave Eisen asked about motions. Doug Merritt introduced himself as a nearby neighbor, owning the Old No. 4 Firehouse on Lincolnway and thanked Mr. Morris for his dedication to preserving. However, Doug was concerned the arched window in the garage door doesn't match the rest of the house. Mr. Morris explained the front door does have an arch, as well as the gable. Terry asked Ken Prince for more staff opinion. Ken responded that given the existing condition, this alteration is a significant investment. Judy Gray asked about pictures from the story map. Chairman opened the floor for public hearing. There was no one present to speak in favor or against this Certificate of Appropriateness.

Doug Merritt made the finding of facts motion, seconded by Dave Eisen:

I move that this Historic Preservation Commission find as fact that the proposed project 15-04, if constructed according to the plans submitted on November 10, 2015, is compatible with the character of the house for the reason that in addition to matching each other and allowing for a more aesthetically pleasing look, these doors also match the historic look better than what is existing.

Doug Merritt made the motion for approval, seconded by Dave Eisen:

Based on the preceding finding of fact, I move that the Historic Preservation Commission grant a certificate of appropriateness to Thomas Morris, owner of 128 N. Brook, for application 15-04.

Christa Hill asked Mr. Morris if he had plans for other renovations on the house and the HPC could give him some guidance on if he needed to bring that before the Commission or not. Mr. Morris indicated he wanted to paint the trim and pave the cracked driveway. Christa said paving does not require a COA.

Ken said the painting would only need a COA if he was changing the color and it was not maintenance. Mr. Morris indicated he would like to change the color of the trim, so he will submit for a COA when that time comes. Cliff Zenor asked if the owner couldn't get this exact door would he need to come back for another COA? The recommendation and findings of fact do not use a specific brand or model number, so as long as it meets what was approved, another COA would not be required. Anything on the inside, like remodeling the kitchen, is not under the jurisdiction of the HPC.

Terry DeMaegd asked to amend the order of the meeting to allow Ken Prince to speak earlier in the meeting so we weren't taking up too much of his time.

NEW BUSINESS

Procedure for dealing with emergency work on landmarks.

Ken Prince started by going back over the sewer work project along Mishawaka Avenue, which included minimal changes to the park at this time, which were granted a COA, but the HPC was also shown the long term plan for the park. As the project progressed, the willow tree at the bottom of the rock garden near the river fell down and there were problems getting that out. Then a worker from one of the contractors fell on the stairs because they were in disrepair. Safety and legal put us on notice that there was a problem and it needed to be fixed. The Mayor and City Engineer Gary West decided to replace the wall by the restroom. Ken admitted that the administration did not communicate that well enough to the HPC. The work that was done/is being done is just as good as the WPA work. In some cases, even better, by adding a foundation to keep the wall from falling or leaning. In the future, the City will work to provide better notice to the HPC as they are the stewards and watchdogs for our historic places. The City, as the owner of the property, is allowed to make repairs, in a like for like situation, similar to what we just explained to Mr. Morris about his property. But the City should be notifying the HPC and are open to how that communication will happen.

Terry DeMaegd noted that notification was only given after the fact. Bryan Tanner admits he was the one to "stir the pot", but agrees it was maintenance.

Ken agreed better notice should be given, but COAs are not required for repairs. For example, Shanower was repaired, but it was in a place most people don't see.

Bryan said once it was made known that someone had fallen, he may have witnessed that or another incident where first responders had been called to the park.

Ken said they have to decide if there are additional areas that are worth replacing.

Terry asked if the wall is in such bad shape, could the City provide a general COA for the entire rock wall?

Ken doesn't think the City should be treated different than any other owner since these repairs would be considered a repair, not a change.

Terry suggested a memorandum of understanding of the scope of repairs instead.

Ken agreed there have been other repairs that have not been done to as good of quality.

Bryan gave the example of fascia behind a gutter.

Ken said the WPA work is limited to the golf course and Merrifield Park, which is not designated. There was one area that was left to fall part because of DNR regulations when it comes to the river. Ken also gave the example of Castle Manor becoming handicap accessible. These projects are not historic, but the HPC should still be notified.

Terry asked for a MOU of the description of work to be done in Battell Park.

Committee Reports:

Historic Districts/Plaques: Kate Voelker was not at the meeting to report if she had contacted Central Services to see if they would be willing to install plaques. Cliff Zenor has contacted a local mason, Russ

Lutkes with Midwest Masonry regarding the Eberhart Major house. They have nothing official, like a contract or a bid, but Cliff is hoping he can get it done during the slower winter season and may not even charge us. Christa Hill asked where the plaque was. Cliff had returned it to the office. Terry DeMaegd asked what the budget was. Christa reported it was \$409.13 after the refund to Mary Watt was processed.

Public Relations and Community Education: There was no report.

Administration/Incentives: The Handbook will be discussed and voted on under New Business.

OLD BUSINESS

Story Map

Bryan Tanner says the story map looks nice and is functional, but will stay where it is, and not be uploaded to the City's website until the MLS-type sheets have been completed for each landmark/district. He passed around a sample page which includes a summary, image, address, date built, date landmarked, and architectural style on the front, with a second page with more detailed research. These will also be included as an appendix in the Handbook. Once that is completed, we will talk to IT about getting a direct link on our website. Once it is on the City's website, it limits the changes that can be made and who can make those changes.

Handbook Comments/Vote on Handbook

Terry DeMaegd learned a lot by reading it. Good format. Cliff Zenor asked if we could add the ordinance number to the info page for each landmark. It is something that is included in the current format. Bryan Tanner can add that to the MLS-type sheets. We also want to include the previous surveys as a digital appendix.

A motion by Terry DeMaegd, seconded by Dave Eisen approved the Handbook, subject to three changes: 1) include adding a length of time of 12 months on page 15 to match Plan Commission and Board of Zoning Appeals rules; 2) adding ordinance number to info pages, and 3) adding digital copies of the 1979 and 1995 surveys as Appendix E.

NEW BUSINESS

Completed Gym Floor Pieces

Cliff Zenor reported 30 gym floor pieces have been completed by the Eagle Scouts. Because the Boy Scouts are involved, we want to donate several of them. Previous suggestions were the Mayor, Ken Prince and Greg Kil, Housing Authority (manage apartments), Heritage Center (library), Hannah Lindahl Children's Museum, The Res, Boy Scouts, Mishawaka High School/School Board and Zilkowski Construction. Cliff asked why The Res was added to the list. Doug Merritt confirmed the Boy Scouts camp there. There is a public space available for rent. If it is too public of a space, we are afraid it will get stolen. Jennifer Johns says her son is in the Boy Scouts and he doesn't camp at The Res because it is too small. Doug agreed the better place would be at the LaSalle Council building so The Res was removed from the list. Alan Grezskowiak asked for background on the project. Cliff gave a brief history from getting the gym floor out of the old high school during renovations through having them assembled by the Boy Scouts. We think the bet time for the presentation would be in May, during Historic Preservation Month at a City Council meeting. Having the meeting in May will give us time to invite representatives from each recipient to the meeting. Since we need a goal for the money, this will give us time to discuss and vote on one, like plaques, then we could promote them in May. Cliff thinks the whole troop should be invited since they all worked on the project.

Lincoln Highway Torch Nominees

Terry DeMaegd says the nomination process is open to the public, so anyone can nominate, it doesn't have to be a function of the Commission. Bryan Tanner says there is a link to the nomination form on the City's website. Shirley McAlister said the deadline is January 31, 2016. She asked what the route would be. Terry said the route was not set yet. It is still a long way off, in October. The County Commissioners will have the final say.

2016 Meeting Dates

Christa Hill created a calendar of meeting dates, deadlines for items requiring a public hearing, and Council meeting dates for landmark nominations. There was a discrepancy on the as to the date of the July meeting. Tuesday is the 5th. There are two election days (May and November) and we will move those meetings to the Wednesday following. Once those changes have been made, Christa will send to IT to be posted online. A motion by Bryan Tanner and Alan Greszkowiak approved the 2016 calendar subject to the changes discussed.

Review 2015 Goals

This was attached. Put on January agenda.

PRIVILEGE OF THE FLOOR

Christa Hill as received a "save the date" for the 2016 Preserving Historic Places conference. This time it is being held in Vincennes, which is very far south and west. Cliff Zenor reminded everyone about the scholarship and hitching a ride with Todd Zieger of Indiana Landmarks.

Mishawaka Garden Club was claiming monies raised were going towards the Battell Park Rock Garden. Christa Hill asked if anyone was in or knew someone in the Garden Club we could contact. Cliff Zenor clarified that was for plantings.

Mary Watt, who attended a meeting a couple months ago, called to let us know she did receive her refund. Mrs. Watt is also interested in getting Local Landmark status for 1207 Prospect, the house to the west of 1213 Prospect. She has the paperwork to fill out, but because it is not in the survey, she will have to provide most of the background information. Christa Hill asked if it would be better to do another single landmark, or make a district out of both houses. Cliff and Doug see it as a hard sell. Mrs. Watt was unable to get any sort of protection from Indiana Landmarks because they reserve that only for "Outstanding" properties.

Staff received another application for an advisory member from Jason Stoller, the new owner of the Merrifield Cass House at 816 Lincolnway East. This is only a National Landmark, so if the owner is interested, we should try to get it as a Local Landmark as well.

Cliff Zenor had an article announcing Catherine Hostetler had recently retired as director of the South Bend/St. Joseph County Historic Preservation Commission. He thought it would be appropriate if we wrote her a congratulatory letter on our behalf. Christa Hill had been notified that Ms. Hostetler was retiring, but wasn't able to make it to the retirement party. Christa has a good relationship with Elicia Feasel, who has been named successor and often contacts them for guidance before bothering Indiana Landmarks.

Bryan Tanner and Jennifer Johns moved to **ADJOURN** the meeting at **5:20 pm**.

Terry DeMaegd, Chairman

Christa Hill, Secretary